

**LATIN AMERICAN DOMESTIC WORKERS ABROAD:
PERSPECTIVES FROM SPAIN**

Ángeles Escrivá and Magdalena Díaz-Gorfinkiel¹

Introduction

Latin America has a long history of servitude and a more recent record of paid domestic and care work, both inside the region and overseas. While some continuity in the sector between periods and locations can be observed, other features of the activity have been changing over the years, affecting the national and international dynamics of the sector as well as the social processes linked to them.

In this chapter, we analyze the presence of Latin American domestic workers abroad, with a focus on Spain. This country has become a main destination for Latin American domestic workers since the late 1980s. A combination of historical conditions with more recent push and pull factors has shaped this migration corridor. In the following sections, we offer a profile of Latin American domestic workers, attending to their diversity in origins and trajectories. The characteristics of the context of labour incorporation are also addressed, including a typology of job modalities, the legislative framework and the working and living conditions often related to it. Specific points are made in relation to the relevance of the caremarket for the elderly, taking into account both live-in and live-out domestic employment, in which Latin Americans concentrate. In addition, other related topics such as the presence of the state and other social agents in facilitating the reconciliation of work and family life, or the gender and class relations that domestic work involves, are mentioned throughout the analysis. A brief historical overview of domestic work in Latin America precedes this discussion. The chapter argues that it is essential to take into account the historical context of how

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

domestic service has emerged and been configured over time in the context of Latin America as well as the ways in which class and race intersect to shape the nature of the profession over time.

An historical overview of domestic work in Latin America

Latin America has a long tradition of domestic employment, and although migration for work abroad captures most attention nowadays, other trajectories were, and are still, present. Before the twentieth century, the American continent was a destination for European and non-European domestic workers, in the form of slavery, patronage, life-long servitude or temporary work contracts. In a few countries, European immigration continued well after the Second World War (Moya 1998). Since the last century, however, increasing numbers of internal migrants moving from rural areas to urban settings provided a native workforce, which in turn, replaced foreign labor. This demographic shift has also been part of wider social and ideological transformations (Hojman 1989). Later, the impoverishment of Latin American economies and the rising demand for paid domestic labor from wealthier countries, have led to a new trend: the emigration of Latin Americans to serve in private households abroad (Pessar 2005).

The vast majority of Latin American domestic workers, both abroad and in the region, are women. However, the sex composition of this workforce has changed over time and has come to depend, among other things, on the characteristics of the employment. In the pre-industrial age, servants included men and women, especially the young and those from rural backgrounds (Sarti 2008). With industrial modernization, the value assigned to household tasks decreased and gender ideologies that praised women's place as unpaid homemakers and providers of care was challenged, contributing to the

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

racialisation and feminisation of the domestic workforce (Kuznesof 1989). Today, men are employed as domestic workers for specific tasks - as gardeners, chauffeurs, and caretakers of heavy patients. In overseas migration, this often responds to their need to be eligible for inclusion in regularization processes.ⁱⁱ Beyond this, however, their labor incorporation in this sector has to conform to masculine imaginaries, and therefore it is justified on the basis of changing cultural norms and unexpected circumstances (McIlwaine 2010, Sarti 2008). Yet, we are still not witnessing a masculinization of domestic employment in Latin America. On the contrary, the ongoing depreciation of domestic service in the realm of collective subjectivities, and an ever-growing supply of female labor from all continents contribute to keep the idea that domestic work is for female rather than male hands (Moya 2007).

Another point of comparison between former and contemporary domestic workers relates to the age of servants. As in the case of preindustrial Europe, in Latin America live-in domestic workers originating from internal migration have been mainly girls and young women who have secured jobs in homes in the absence of factory employment (Potthast 2006). The terms “*criada*” in Spanish and “maid” in English refer to the young age and minor status of servants, who moved out or were sent by their families in rural areas to the cities to reduce economic burdens and to improve their educational and work opportunities. On the contrary, in the age of the so-called “imperialistic servants”, the average age of domestic workers was not that low. Recalling British historical patterns, research shows that it was common for single, mature women and widows to find domestic employment overseas (Horn 1975). Likewise today, people from all ages compose the international domestic workforce moving from Latin America, including young people and mothers who have left their children behind, as well as those in

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

advanced age. The latter will probably constitute a growing category in the decades to come, enrolling in paid domestic work, either to secure an income for themselves or to aid their grown up children, grandchildren and even very old parents, as reported among Latin Americans in Spain (Escrivá and Skinner 2006) or Eastern Europeans all over Western Europe. For these mature domestic workers, Ralitzia Soutanova (2007) uses the expression “end career migrants” to highlight that they enter into domestic employment at a later stage in their lives, after widespread experience of employment in another sector or having been housewives.

Racist hierarchies have commonly helped to legitimate the immutable position of servants. This has had a special impact in Latin America. The racist stance of Spanish as well as British and other imperialisms, that identified certain people’s phenotypical features with inferior capacities, permeated in the colonies and has survived until the present day (Radcliffe 1999). Persistent social organization based on flagrant ethno-racial and gender hierarchies has kept domestic workers in particular in the lower end of the labor market resulting in poor working conditions and an undervaluing of their jobs as much in Latin America as in countries where they migrate. In light of this, it is no wonder that when moving abroad, many middle class Latin Americans perceive their new jobs in household services as highly exploitative. Following similar paths to many others before, the medium term strategy is to move out of domestic work, especially from live-in to live-out regimes, and search for other ‘better’ occupations (Escrivá and Skinner 2008; Hondagneu-Sotelo and Avila 1997).

In summary, domestic work offers a fruitful terrain for analyzing the social structures and relations between individuals and groups in different historical periods and parts of

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

the world. In Latin America, as elsewhere, domestic work can be viewed as much as a form of slave labor or servitude, as an apprenticeship for later family formation, or in a more modern version of capitalist free market transaction, as the embodiment of the servant-master through an employee-employer relationship. All these forms are based on unequal economic and social relations, where gender, age, race, origin and citizenship status have served to create deep disparities (Anthias and Lazaridis 2000, Oliveira and Ariza 1998, Young 1987). This uneven relationship at the micro level reflects broader patterns of uneven global development within and between nations.

Although domestic servants have been viewed as dominated subjects, they have historically also been active agents as purveyors of ideologies. Because of their direct intrusion in private family life, domestic workers have often acquired certain civilizing or moralizing roles, directly promoted by states, intermediaries (such as religious congregations) or employers, or even by the employees themselves. Rafaella Sarti (2008) summarizes the different roles that subsequent flows of overseas domestics moving from the metropolis to the colonies and *vice versa* have played through the centuries. Examples of this are the Spanish “imperialistic” and “colonialist servants” who were the ones responsible for carrying the language and habits of the country of origin to the employers’ household, with their move to the Latin American colonies viewed as having a ‘civilizing’ effect on the region as a whole. Similarly, contemporary “servants of globalization”, a term coined by Rachel Parreñas (2001) to refer mainly to Latin American or South Asian women, are moving from the peripheries of the world’s economies to the private homes of the economic centers. Consciously or unconsciously, they are instrumental in meeting certain aims; first, in maintaining prevailing gender ideologies and dissolving conflicts between couples, which in turn means that men are

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

not required to participate more fully in domestic chores (Tobío and Díaz 2007); second, in controlling and reinforcing religious values, when maids are recruited by religious organizations (Wagner 2010); and third, in encouraging the gain or regain of some political/linguistic equilibrium in a given setting.ⁱⁱⁱ

A final point to mention is that most of our knowledge about the characteristics and conditions of domestic work and workers in Latin America in the pre-emigratory period was created by feminist research in the 1970s and 1980s (Jelin 1976, Young 1987). At that time, consciousness and claims of domestic workers and their organizations was strengthened across the region (Chaney and Garcia 1989). In a parallel process, European and North American feminist researchers were widely engaged in the study of the persistent gendering of domestic work and the low value attributed to it, despite major societal advances (Bock and Duden 1977, cited in Lutz 2007, 187).

Historical accounts inform us how during much of the twentieth century paid domestic work decreased dramatically in Anglo-Saxon and other industrialized European nations (Sarti 2005), whereas in other countries it increased internally and became an exported commodity. Academic, as well as literary and film work, depicts the lives of many Spanish, Portuguese or Italian women of poorer rural regions moving to the more urbanized areas in the postwar period and until recently (Oso 2004, Sarasúa 1994).

Yet, although there was a temporary decrease in paid domestic work in some of these OECD countries, and a long tradition of migration for domestic work in others, since the end of the XXth century all of them became net importers of maids especially coming from Latin America in the cases of the United States and Spain.

Diversity of origins and trajectories of migrant domestic workers from Latin America

Domestic work has become an important economic activity in Latin America, given that it amounted to an average of 7 percent of the total urban employment for the region in 2003 (ILO 2005). Internal and international migrants make up a large proportion of those working as domestic workers. Within Latin America, people tended to migrate first to neighboring countries if they were wealthier. Venezuela, for example, became a destination country for Dominicans, Colombians, and even Peruvians, from the 1960s to the 1980s (Torrealba 1992). Today in South America, Chile and Argentina attract women searching for domestic jobs from Peru, Bolivia and Paraguay (Stefoni 2008), while in Central America, Costa Rica receives mainly Nicaraguan migrant women (ILO 2002). In the USA, Mexicans and Puerto Ricans tended to substitute for the partial retreat of African American women from domestic service (Glenn 2007). Nevertheless, from the late 1980s onwards, other more distant countries became accessible to Latin American women who were in search of work abroad, either independently or following their male partners, or together with the families for whom they had been employed in the country of origin. In Angeles Escrivá's (1999) research on Peruvian domestic workers in Barcelona, she encountered several pioneer women who had arrived in Spain in the 1970s and 1980s, working for the same families as in Lima. This path is even more visible in the UK, following the history of returning expatriate British families, or in the USA, as noted by Pierrette Hondagneu-Sotelo (2001) when talking about her mother who as a young woman moved from Chile to the USA following the American family she had been working for.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Concerning the diversity of migration and occupational trajectories, Safa (1984) pointed out more than two decades ago that the labor incorporation of migrant women to receiving countries like the USA follows very diverse patterns. Among the trajectories related to domestic work, we highlight the following processes as key to understanding international domestic work from Latin America to Spain. First, in many cases, given that it is not the poorest of the poor who migrate in the first instance, those searching for domestic employment do not initially have experience of paid domestic work; instead they are often employers of other lower status women back home (Restrepo 2006). Second, in other cases, migrant women obtain experience of domestic work on their way to a final destination, following a path from countryside to an urban setting, and from there to a middle-income country until arriving in a higher-income country. This is the case of Peruvians interviewed by Escrivá (1999), who had a background of migration from the highlands to the coast, then to Argentina/Chile, later to Spain or Italy, and much later to another European country such as the UK. Third, and in a similar manner, previous internal migrants directly migrate to perform the same job for new employers abroad, being replaced by their daughters later on. For example, many Dominicans from the rural South-west province of Barahona who settled in Madrid in the late 1980s and early 1990s followed this path (Gregorio 1998, Sørensen 2005). Fourth, there is evidence that sometimes migrants with families in receiving countries call upon someone from their home town or neighborhood to migrate in order to help them with household chores on a paid or unpaid basis (Escrivá and Skinner 2008). Finally, some agencies and in-origin recruitment programs sponsored by the State are increasingly searching for experienced domestic workers, nurses and professional caretakers in source countries.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

The key issue however, is that many Latin Americans are employed as domestic workers at least for some time during their life abroad whatever the woman's background and trajectory, and whether this work was planned or not before migrating (McIlwaine 2010, Menjívar 2003, Oso 2007). This experience of paid domestic work includes a range of different regimes, usually differentiated on a live-in or live-out basis, and in the latter case, jobs are divided into full time or part time /per hour jobs, that may entail being employed in different households. Live-in employment is more available to newly arrived and undocumented migrants and is increasingly common in Spain (Parella 2003). The tasks requested of domestic workers in households may also differ substantially, from caretaking of dependants, pets and gardening, to cooking, cleaning or general housekeeping. Sometimes domestic workers are given household management responsibilities such as budgeting and shopping. This requires employees having a good command of the language and knowledge of the social norms in place.

Employment of live-in and live-out domestic caretakers in Spain

Not only do Latin American domestic workers abroad show a strong diversity in nationality origins and employment trajectories, but the receiving contexts offer a great diversity in terms of immigration legislation, demographic structures as well as family and institutional arrangements. These variables clearly affect the practice of employing domestic workers in different contexts.

Researchers argue that migrant women's incorporation into household services is high where all or some of the following conditions exist: a strong tradition of domestic servitude, familism, weak industrial economies with less supportive welfare states, and

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

high rates of female incorporation into full-time paid employment. This is the case all around Latin America, and in many parts of Europe and the US (Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2003, Williams and Gavanas 2008). However, other factors influence the greater popularity in certain societies for employing live-in helpers than in others. On one hand, it makes a difference whether the job is just for cleaning, cooking and general domestic tasks, or entails caring work for babies, the sick and the elderly at home, the latter requiring more intensive working days. On the other hand, employing someone on a live-in basis requires a certain attitude or predisposition from the employer's side, who has to address and marry her own needs and desires with social expectations and norms that relate to wider "cultures of care" (Finch 1989, Tobío 2005). Expectations and desires with regard to eldercare may diverge among generations and depend on previous life experience. While coping with the constant presence of a domestic worker may be easier for individuals who have been living more independently and have been less reliant on their extended family or other networks, in Spain carework is still mainly provided by the family and only when absolutely necessary other sources of help are sought (Martínez 2010). Therefore, many elderly are quite often against putting someone strange in their house and avoid it as long as they can. Finally, their adult children are the ones who have to make the decision to employ a domestic careworker, sometimes against their older parents will (Colectivo Ioé 2005).

Complementary explanations of the persistence and even increase in paid domestic and care work relates to: first, changing demographic circumstances (including population aging and growing inflows of migrant women accepting especially live-in jobs); second, the cutback in state expenditures in caring and the privatization of personal services; and third, the nature of housing arrangements and attitudes towards being at home

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

among employers' families. In particular, when home ownership is widespread and when the elderly do not wish to be put in nursing/elder homes when they become fragile, the number of live-in domestic workers is much higher. All three factors are interrelated in the Spanish case (Berjano, Simó and Ariño 2005, Escrivá and Skinner 2008, Rodríguez et al. 2010).

Therefore, the new trend in domestic service is the increasing demand on elder care. Research in Spain analyzes the physical, mental and emotional effort that domestic caring work for elderly people involves (Escrivá 2004, Vega 2009 Martínez 2010). These authors have argued that characteristics now required of domestic workers, such as being able to conduct a wide range of household chores, as well as to be a good nurse, a companion and to show respect and affection for the elderly, makes (in principle) Latin American women especially suitable for eldercare in Spain because of linguistic and cultural proximity.

In accordance, Martinez (2010) has noted that daughters who employ Latin American workers to care for their elderly parents, prefer warmth over technical knowledge (professionalism), since they expect them to behave as if they were their own daughters, far from the cold and distant treatment one may receive from medical staff. Yet, apart from emotional care, elderly people with poor physical and mental health have to receive constant medications and treatments. This necessarily begs the question as to what training non-professional care workers should follow to look after the sick and disabled (Cangiano *et al*, 2009, Colectivo Ioé 2005). Some authors suggest dealing with this question beyond the general frame of the domestic work sector in Spain, given its low status and bad labor conditions (Martínez 2010).

The intimate proximity sought in the relationship between the caretaker and the elderly person differs from the distant relationship pointed out by Anderson (2000) in some *au pair* and domestic arrangements. For some of Anderson's interviewees, the domestic helper was thought to be "one of the family", which in turn was used as a justification for putting your loved ones in somebody else's hands in a position that requires a lot of trust and empathy. For others, there was a desire to maintain distance with their employees in order to control their activities and avoid coming into competition for their children's affection, so that proximity was not confused with intimacy, thus contributing to the social alienation of the foreign worker in the domestic sphere (Mundlak and Shamir, 2008).

Finally, because of the real or perceived suitability of certain workers to specific tasks, in most societies a hierarchy of positions and jobs by nationality (reflected in language, skin color and body appearance, religion, or "cultural proximity") emerges (Anderson 2000, Cox 1999). This is a social order that fellow migrant women usually defend and thus contribute to reinforce, as is the case among Latin American domestic workers (Tamagno 2002, Vega 2009). Not only does such a hierarchy mean that women of a certain background will have limited chance to get other jobs than those attributed to their kind, but also that the best jobs (best paid, valued, and most gratifying) are confined to the same, more advantaged groups.

Legal frameworks and policies toward domestic work and overseas immigration

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Social preferences for certain migrant domestic and care workers have been translated into legal measures in order to select specific groups and allow them to enjoy more favorable conditions in destination countries. This preferential treatment has applied to Latin Americans in Spain in a comparable way to Commonwealth citizens in the United Kingdom. Legal differences have included advantages in professional recognition, in-origin recruitment, as well as access to citizenship rights such as voting and naturalization thanks to bilateral agreements.^{iv} Apart from these measures, the Spanish government has been less reluctant to limit Latin American migration, which has resulted in higher rates of success in regularization processes and family reunification procedures. Except for a few cases where the United States has been more open to certain Latin American groups (such as refugees from Cuba or citizens of the associated State of Puerto Rico), there has been little favoritism towards Latin Americans working as domestics. On the contrary, Mexicans and Central Americans are especially discriminated against in the US (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001).

Migrant domestic workers' legal status has consequences for their living and working conditions, but also beyond the immediate and the individual. On the one hand, while in the USA many domestic workers remain undocumented for years, in Spain they have systematically been able to obtain work permits through amnesties and in-origin recruitment. On the contrary, in the UK foreign household helpers usually work while holding statuses not (or not fully) designed for that purpose (students, *au pairs*, asylum seekers and spouses of legal residents). As a result of fewer legal constraints until now, Latin Americans have been more able to reunite their loved and dependent people in the short run, as well as to move out of the domestic service in Spain than in other countries (as noted by Ozyegin and Hondagneu-Sotelo 2008). This procedure, although

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

publicized as a policy favoring human rights, has been criticised by others for entailing a call effect (a pull factor), given that a continuous substitution of those leaving the sector (due to poor conditions and status change) is required. Nonetheless, a high turnover has also helped to keep salaries low and to introduce a more exploitable labor force. Yet, in order to avoid high turnover and permanent settlement of care workers, the Spanish government could be tempted to implement, similarly to countries like the UK, stricter controls in order to facilitate the formal migration of nurses and caretakers from overseas with short-term visas, limited to a single employer, and with no family reunification rights (Galloti 2009).

On the other hand, even if holding a valid work permit, as domestic employees, Latin American women continue to suffer comparatively worse occupational status than all other registered workers. In Spain, waged domestic work is still included in a special labor regime that assigns lower social benefits, more flexible and long working hours, no career advancement, non-standardized labor conditions, and lack of control over employers' observance of the law (Colectio Ioé 2001). Nowadays, in a period of high unemployment, migrant women have no access to public subsidies, while their male fellow countrymen who work in construction do. Even less protected are domestic workers in the US (Ariza 2008). Social rights such as paid vacations, annual bonuses and holiday cover are non-existent, and live-in domestic workers as well as personal attendants dedicated primarily to care work remain excluded from federal regulations concerning minimum salaries, weekly working hours and overtime payments. State initiatives undertaken by regional governments such as those of New York and California have modified these general federal regulations and improved domestic

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

workers conditions, most commonly following pressure exercised by domestic workers and their representatives (DWU & D 2006, Delp and Quan 2002).

Collective action and organization of Latin American domestic workers

Individual and collective action at different levels and the alliance of different governmental and non- governmental actors are common ingredients of any attempt to address the abuses and the inferior labor status of domestic workers.

First, we need a thorough understanding of the many different constraints faced by domestic workers. As women's domestic work is performed in private domains and is often unregistered, this activity is generally not visible nor considered a true labor relation. The fact that domestic work is regarded as a private labor relation or what Anderson (2007) refers to as "a very private business", underpins the possibilities of recognition and enforcement of work-related social rights. Second, Lautier (2003) affirms that the predisposition of domestic workers is an important barrier to collective action. He notes how women are often more interested in negotiating individually their relationships with employers or *patronas*, given their isolation and the very nature of the master-servant relation, than trying to change labor conditions collectively. This is referred to as a kind of "false conscience", since these women see their condition as temporary and try to hide it when outside the employer's home. Third, social agents such as trade unions in Spain have traditionally disregarded domestic service as a priority, and have been mainly active launching information and awareness campaigns (Peterson 2007). Religious groups have tended to maintain the *status quo* by messages of modesty and sacrifice, thereby avoiding confronting political actors and the better-off members

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

of their parishes. This has been the case at large in Italy or Spain, where nuns have played a very important role recruiting and placing domestic workers in Catholic households, as well as negotiating the conflicts between employers and employees, usually tipping the balance in the employer's favor (Andall 2000, Escrivá 2003). Yet, as regards to the US (Hondagneu-Sotelo 2008) and other countries, some Christian leaders have been extremely active in claiming and supporting actions for immigrants' rights more generally. In so doing, they have helped immigrant domestic women to fulfill their needs, and to organize for labor, civil and immigrant rights.

Far from a victimization and passive perspective, our final focus is on how domestic workers have taken several collective actions in different and distant locations, with or without the support of established trade unions and other social actors, to improve their condition.

In Spain, there was an attempt promoted by solidarity organizations, trade unions and domestic workers associations to remove the special labor regime of domestic service workers and incorporate them into the general labor regime between 2004 and 2006. However, this initiative got stuck in the legislative process (León 2010). In addition, politicians have been waiting for transformations in the homecare sector after the implementation of the so-called "Dependency law" starting in 2007, although public funding cuts since 2008 due to the economic crisis has ruined any prospects of this becoming a reality.

More recently, the United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (INSTRAW), now a part of UN-WOMEN, with financial

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

support from the Spanish International Cooperation Agency (AECI), launched an action-research project aimed at mobilizing the social actors involved and pushing the process towards better social recognition of the value of domestic work as well as assessing the personal costs to migrant workers. This project involved meetings that gathered together different organizations that have been, but in a separate manner, claiming for the improvements of the sector such as *Territorio Doméstico*, *Precarias a la Deriva* and *Servicio Doméstico Activo* (SEDOAC), and a march on the annual day for domestic workers (28th March 2010).^v Interestingly, this initiative has a transnational stance, involving action-research in Spain and countries of Latin America (Ecuador, Peru, Bolivia and Chile) with the aim to include national and international bodies and non-state actors based in all these places.

Transnational campaigns and cooperation has indeed proved to be more effective in addressing the issues that affect people from any- and everywhere and represent a more serious turn than solely national efforts (Galloti 2009, ILO MIGRANDINA project). Long and intense national and international campaigning to raise awareness and lobby for better conditions for all and especially migrant domestic workers has finally led to the decision to create the International Convention on Decent Work for Domestic Workers that will be foreseeable launched in 2011.

Conclusions

Under the generic term of Latin American domestic workers in European and North American countries there are a diversity of peoples and trajectories, based on the characteristics of different groups and contexts of reception. Prevailing care and gender

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

regimes in sending and receiving societies shape the domestic employment for Latin Americans, and other migrant women. In accordance, the demand for female migrant labor suggests continuity with the demand for domestic work that was previously covered with local and internal migrant women, but change in relation to the sector of work where there is growing demand of care work for the elderly (as Andall, 2005, also notes for the case of Italy). Migration regimes add complexity to the picture, often condemning waged domestic work to irregularity and devaluation.

Even though the sector offers opportunities to the workers, there is some consensus on the need to improve the conditions and regulations governing paid domestic and care work. Although some steps have been taken in this direction, as Anderson (2010) so lively describes it for the UK policy, this is a “one step forward, two steps back” process. The “Dependency law” passed in 2007 in Spain, also secondary thought to help to improve the status and conditions of informal migrant careworkers, has been poorly implemented with recent funding cuts likely to undermine this further. The negotiations between the State-trade unions-employers’ organizations carried on by the end of 2010, to restore the Spanish economy with changes on the labor market under EU pressures, have been another lost opportunity to move into the inclusion of domestic workers in the general workers regime. Unlike other groups of typically excluded workers as the agriculture laborers who have recently been granted inclusion in this more beneficial regime, León (2010) notes that trade unions do not represent household employees in collective agreements and that is a factor that militates against the promotion of the demands of this group on the political agenda.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

In general terms, it can be defended that there where the State is subsidizing eldercare and care workers are employed by external organizations instead of by the families, their labor conditions seem to be better guaranteed. This would also serve to the inclusion of domestic workers in the general workers regime, giving them more chances to unionize and make their working conditions more accountable. More private and public provisions would help to externalize those family-related activities that are now exclusively women's responsibility. A better balance between the sexes with regard to paid and unpaid work would also help to avoid employing large numbers of nannies and housekeepers. This discussion has particular resonance in Europe where many policy recommendations include specific regulations such as taking the "reconciliation of labor and family/private life" as a pending matter to integrate into all areas of the educational and labor market. However, immigrant domestic work has been excluded from a debate that focused mainly in gender inequalities in unpaid domestic work (Peterson 2007).

Yet, as people live longer, an aged population poses new challenges for families, societies and states. An increasing demand for care workers is expected in the years and decades to come. In some places, the fragile elderly wish to stay at their own homes, in other places the system is designed for them to move to collective homes where care workers are organized in a more labor standardized way. Yet the tendency in North America and Europe is to avoid the institutionalization of the elderly so that costs do not so heavily rely on the public expenditures.

On the other hand, the implementation of restrictive norms for immigrant domestic and care workers, poses new questions such as whether it will be morally sustainable (taking into account all international civil and human rights charters) to restrict people's

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

mobility between territories independently of nationality and immigration status, or to condemn them to lifelong servitude. Finally, yet importantly, is the question of how sending societies in Latin America will manage to protect their younger and older generations when their own middle generations are gone (see also Herrera this volume).

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

REFERENCES

Andall, Jacqueline. 2000. Organizing domestic workers in Italy: the challenges of gender, class and ethnicity. In *Gender and migration in Southern Europe. Women on the move*, ed. Anthias, Floya and Gabriella Lazaridis, 145-71. Oxford: Berg publishers.

Andall, Jacqueline. 2005. Change and continuity in the Italian domestic work sector. Paper presented at the international conference on Migration and Domestic Work in Global Perspective, May 26-29, in Wassenaar, The Netherlands.

Anderson, Bridget. 2000. *Doing the dirty work? The global politics of domestic labour*. London: Zed books.

Anderson, Bridget. 2007. A very private business. Exploring the demand for migrant domestic workers. *European Journal of Women's studies*, Special issue on Domestic work edited by Helma Lutz, 14 (3): 247-64.

Anderson, Bridget. 2010. Mobilizing migrants, making citizens: migrant domestic workers as political agents. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 33(1): 60-74.

Anthias, Floya and Gabriella Lazaridis. 2000. Introduction: Women on the move in Southern Europe. In *Gender and migration in Southern Europe: Women on the move*, ed. Floya Anthias and Gabriella Lazaridis, 1-14. Oxford: Berg.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Ariza, Marina. 2008. Migration and female labor markets in the context of globalization: Latina domestic workers in Madrid and New York. Paper presented at the European Population Association Congress, July, 9-12, in Barcelona, Spain.

Berjano, Enrique, Carles Simó and Antonio Ariño. 2005. Condicionantes de la aparición del fenómeno social “inmigrantes que cuidan a mayores”. In *Cuidado a la dependencia e inmigración*. Informe de resultados, ed. IMSERSO, 21-121. Madrid: Instituto de Mayores y Servicios Sociales.

Cangiano, Alessio, Isabel Shutes, Sarah Spencer and George Leeson. 2009. Migrant care workers in ageing societies. Research findings in the United Kingdom. Report COMPAS.

Chaney, Elsa and Maria Garcia .1989. *Muchachas no more. Household workers in Latin America and the Caribbean*. Temple University press.

Colectivo Ioé. 2001. *Mujer, trabajo y migración*. Madrid: Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social.

Colectivo Ioé. 2005. El cuidado de personas mayores dependientes realizado por ciudadanos inmigrantes en la Comunidad de Madrid. In *Cuidado a la dependencia e inmigración*. Informe de resultados, ed. IMSERSO, 233-370. Madrid: Instituto de Mayores y Servicios Sociales.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Cox, Rosie. 1999. The role of ethnicity in shaping the domestic employment in Britain. In *Gender, migration and domestic work*, ed. Janet H. Momsen, 134-47. Oxon: Routledge.

Delp, Linda and Katie Quan. 2002. Homecare worker organizing in California: an analysis of a successful strategy. *Labor Studies Journal* 27(1): 1-23.

Domestic workers United & Datacenter. 2006. Home is where the work is: inside New York domestic industry. <http://www.datacenter.org/wpcontent/uploads/homeiswheretheworkis.pdf>

Ehrenreich, Barbara and Arlie R. Hochschild. 2004. *Global Woman. Nannies, maids and sex workers in the new economy*. New York: Metropolitan books.

Escrivá, Angeles. 1999. Mujeres peruanas del servicio doméstico en Barcelona: trayectorias sociolaborales. Tesis Doctoral. Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona.

Escrivá, Angeles. 2003. Latinoamericanos en España: iglesias e integración social. In *Las Iglesias y la Migración*. Actas de las Jornadas celebradas del 25 al 26 de abril. Consejo Evangélico de Madrid – Seminario Teológico UEBE.

Escrivá, Angeles. 2004. Securing the care and welfare of dependants transnationally: Peruvians and Spaniards in Spain. Working paper. Oxford Institute of Ageing.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Escrivá, Angeles and Emmeline Skinner. 2006. Moving to Spain at an advanced age. *Generations Review* 16: 8-15.

Escrivá, Angeles and Emmeline Skinner. 2008. Domestic work and transnational care chains in Spain. In *Migration and domestic work. A European perspective on a global theme*, ed. Helma Lutz, 113-26. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Finch, Janet. 1989. *Family obligation and social change*. Cambridge: Polity press.

Galloti, María. 2009. The gender dimension of domestic work in Western Europe. *International Migration Papers N^o 96*. Geneva: ILO.

Gregorio, Carmen. 1998. *Migración femenina: su impacto en las relaciones de género*. Madrid: Narcea.

Glenn, Evelyn Nakano. 2007. Caring and inequality. In *Women's labor in the global economy. Speaking in multiple voices*, ed. Sharon Harley, 46-61. Rutgers university press.

Hojman, David. 1989. Land reform, female migration and the market for domestic service in Chile. *Journal of Latin American Studies* 21(1): 105-32.

Hondagneu-Sotelo, Pierrette, 2001. *Doméstica. Immigrant workers cleaning and caring in the shadows of affluence*. University of California press.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Hondagneu-Sotelo Pierrette. 2008. *God's heart has no borders. How religious activists are working for immigrant rights*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California press.

Horn, Pamela. 1975. *The rise and fall of the Victorian servant*. Dublin: Gill and New York: MacMillan and St Martin's press.

International Labor Organization. 2005., *Panorama Laboral de América Latina*. Lima: ILO.

International Labor Organization. 2002. *Estudio de hogares de mujeres nicaragüenses emigrantes en Costa Rica*. Nicaragua: ILO.

Jelin, Elizabeth. 1976. Labor migration and female labor participation in Latin America: the case of domestic servants in the cities. *Signs* 3(1): 129-41. Special issue on women and development.

Kuznesof, Elizabeth. 1989. A history of domestic service in Spanish America, 1492-1980. In *Muchachas no more. Household workers in Latin America and the Caribbean*, ed. Elsa Chaney and Maria Garcia, 17-35. Temple University press.

Lautier, Bruno. 2003. Las empleadas domésticas y la sociología del trabajo. *Revista Mexicana de Sociología* 65(4): 789-814.

León, Margarita. 2010. Migration and care work in Spain: the domestic service revisited. *Social Policy and Society* 9(3): 409-418.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Lutz, Helma. 2007. *European Journal of Women's studies*, 14(3) Special issue on Domestic work.

Martínez, Raquel. 2010. *Bienestar y cuidados: El oficio del cariño. Mujeres inmigrantes y mayores nativos*. Madrid: CSIC.

McIlwaine, Cathy. 2010. Migrant machismos: exploring gender ideologies and practices among Latin American migrants in London from a multi-scalar perspective. *Gender, Place & Culture* 17(3): 281-300.

Menjívar, Cecilia. 2003. The intersection of work and gender. Central American immigrant women and employment in California. In *Gender and US Immigration. Contemporary trends*, ed. Pierrette Hondagneu-Sotelo, 101-26. University of California press.

Moya, José. 1998. *Cousins and strangers: Spanish immigrants in Buenos Aires, 1850-1930*. Berkeley: University of California press.

Moya, José. 2007. Domestic service in global perspective: gender, migration, and ethnic niches. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 33(4): 559-79.

Mundlak, Guy and Hila Shamir. 2008. Between intimacy and alienage: the legal construction of domestic and carework in the welfare state. In *Migration and domestic*

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming
work. A European perspective on a global theme, ed. Helma Lutz, 161-76. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Oliveira, Orlandina and Marina Ariza. 1998. Terciarización, feminización de la fuerza de trabajo y precariedad laboral en México. In *Género y Pobreza. Nuevas dimensiones*, ed. Irma Arriagada y Carmen Torres, 111-17. Santiago de Chile: Isis Internacional Ediciones de las Mujeres.

Oso, Laura. 2004. *Españolas en París. Estrategias de ahorro y consumo en las migraciones internacionales*. Barcelona: edicions Bellaterra.

Oso, Laura. 2007. La inserción laboral de la población latinoamericana en España: el protagonismo de las mujeres. In *Nuevas migraciones latinoamericanas a Europa: balances y desafíos*, ed. Isabel Yépez and Gioconda Herrera, 453-79. Flacso-Obreal-UCL-UB.

Ozyegin, Gul and Pierette Hondagneu-Sotelo. 2008. Conclusion: domestic work, migration and the new gender order in contemporary Europe. In *Migration and domestic work. A European perspective on a global theme*, ed. Helma Lutz, 195-208. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Parella, Sonia. 2003. Immigrant women in paid domestic service. The case of Spain and Italy. *Transfer: European Review of Labour and Research* 9(3): 503-517.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Parreñas, Rachel. 2001. *Servants of globalization: women, migration and domestic work*. Stanford University press.

Pessar, Patricia. 2005. Women, gender and international migration across and beyond the Americas: inequalities and limited empowerment. Paper presented at the expert group meeting on international migration and development in Latin America and the Caribbean, November 30-December 2, in Mexico City, Mexico.

Peterson, Elin. 2007. The invisible carers: framing domestic work(ers) in gender equality policies in Spain. *European Journal of Women's studies* 14(3):265-80.

Potthast, Barbara. 2006. Mujeres inmigrantes en América Latina: una perspectiva histórica. In *Un continente en movimiento: migraciones en América Latina*, ed. Ingrid Wehr, 111-30. Madrid: Editorial Iberoamericana/Vervuert.

Radcliffe, Sarah. 1999. Race and domestic service. Migration and identity in Ecuador. In *Gender, migration and domestic work*, ed. Janet H. Momsen, 83-97. Oxon: Routledge.

Restrepo, Ofelia. 2006. *Mujeres colombianas en España. Historias, inmigración y refugio*. Bogotá: editorial Pontificia Universidad Javeriana.

Rodríguez, Vicente, Eva Martín, Silvia Marcu, Santiago Ramos, Fermina Rojo, Gloria Fernández-Mayorales, Raúl Lardies, Jesús Rogero. 2010. Inmigración y cuidados de mayores en los hogares de la Comunidad de Madrid. *Informes Portal Mayores*, nº 102.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Safa, Helen. 1984. The differential incorporation of Hispanic women migrants into the U.S. labor force. In *Women on the Move. Contemporary changes in family and society*, 159-73. Paris: UNESCO.

Sarasúa, Carmen. 1994. *Criados, nodrizas y amos*. Madrid: Siglo XXI.

Sarti, Raffaella. 2005. Conclusion: Domestic service and European identity. Final Report of *the Servant Project*. European Commission.

Sarti, Raffaella. 2008. The globalisation of domestic service. An historical perspective. In *Migration and domestic work. A European perspective on a global theme*, ed. Helma Lutz, 77-97. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Sørensen, Ninna. 2005. Narratives of longing, belonging and caring in the Dominican diaspora. In *Caribbean Narratives*, ed. Jean Besson and Karen F. Olwig, 222-43. London: Macmillan.

Soultanova, Ralitzia. 2007. La migration de fin de carrière. Le cas des femmes bulgares à Madrid. In *Vivre ensemble au XXI^{ème} siècle*. Actes du colloque international de l'Institut de Sociologie, ed. Institut de Sociologie, 471-86. Université Libre de Bruxelles.

- Cathy McIlwaine (ed) Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming
- Stefoni, Carolina. 2008. Migración, Género y Servicio Doméstico. Mujeres Peruanas en Chile. In *Trabajo Doméstico y Equidad de Género en Latinoamérica: Desafíos para el Trabajo Decente*, ed. Claudia Mora and María Elena Valenzuela. Chile: ILO.
- Tamagno, Carla. 2002. “You Must win their affection”. Migrant’s social and cultural practices between Peru and Italy. In *Work and Migration: Life and Livelihoods in a Globalizing World*, ed. Karen Fog Olwig and Ninna Sørensen, 106-26. London: Routledge.
- Tobío, Constanza. 2005. *Madres que trabajan. Dilemas y estrategias*. Madrid: Cátedra.
- Tobío, Constanza and Magdalena Díaz. 2007. New gendered relationships in Spain: the ‘other’ in the care triangle. *International Journal of Iberian Studies* 20 (1): 41-63.
- Torrealba, Ricardo. 1992. *Trabajadoras migrantes en el servicio doméstico en Venezuela*, Documento de Trabajo: Migración y Población. Ginebra: OIT.
- Vega, Cristina. 2009. *Culturas del cuidado en transición. Espacios, sujetos e imaginarios en una sociedad de migración*. Barcelona: editorial UOC.
- Wagner, Heike. 2010. *Dasein für Andere – Dasein als Andere in Europa. Ecuadorianische Hausarbeiterinnen in Privathaushalten und Katholischen Gemeinden Madrids*. Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaft.

Cathy McIlwaine (ed) *Latin American Migration across borders: European perspectives from the UK and beyond*. Palgrave MacMillan, Forthcoming

Williams, Fiona and Anna Gavanas. 2008. The intersection of childcare regimes and migration regimes: a three-country study. In *Migration and domestic work. A European perspective on a global theme*, ed. Helma Lutz, 13-28. Aldershot: Ashgate.

Young, Grace Esther. 1987. The myth of being “like a daughter”. *Latin American Perspectives* 14(3): 365-80.

ⁱ The authors wish to thank Cathy McIlwain for her comments and editing of the chapter.

ⁱⁱ This has been the case in countries like Spain or Italy. In Italy, the “bandanti” (domestic workers and caretakers) are in fact almost the only category under which immigrants can obtain a residence and work permit. That explains why Andall (2000) reports that in 1992, for example, male migrants constituted 61 percent of domestic workers in Sicily. In Spain, quotas have been open to different sectors, and although numbers did not reach that high, still 7 percent of all registered in the domestic workers labor regime in 2008 in Spain were men, according to data from the *Instituto Nacional de Estadística* (INE).

ⁱⁱⁱ This could be the case of countries where subnational or indigenous tongues compete with an official and more worldwide-spread language. In Spain, a way to counteract Catalan advance in Catalonia would be opening the door to the employment of Spanish speaking migrants by Catalan speaking families.

^{iv} In fact, nationals from Latin American countries (and Andorra, Equatorial Guinea, the Philippines, Portugal and Sephardic origins) can apply for Spanish citizenship after only two years legal residence in Spain while migrants from other national origins need to prove at least ten years of legal residence.

^v The banner and some videos from the demonstration were part of an exhibition in the National Art Centre Reina Sofia (Museo Nacional Centro de arte Reina Sofía) in Madrid devoted to modern ways of slavery.